## SULLIVAN, MOUNTJOY, STAINBACK & MILLER PSC

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Ronald M. Sullivan
Jesse T. Mountjoy
Frank Stainback
James M. Miller
Michael A. Fiorella

Michael A. Fiorella Allen W. Holbrook R. Michael Sullivan

Bryan R. Reynolds\*

Tyson A. Kamuf

Mark W. Starnes

C. Ellsworth Mountiny

\*Also Licensed in Indiana

January 25, 2013

RECEIVED

JAN 28 2013 PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

## Via Federal Express

Jeff DeRouen Executive Director Public Service Commission 211 Sower Boulevard, P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615

> Re: In the Matter of: The Application of Big Rivers Electric Corporation for a General Adjustment in Rates, PSC Case No. 2012-00535

Dear Mr. DeRouen:

Enclosed for filing in the above referenced matter are an original and ten copies of the response of Big Rivers Electric Corporation ("Big Rivers") to Kentucky Industrial Utility Customers, Inc.'s Motion for Big Rivers to File a Corrected Notice. I certify that copies of this letter and response have been served on each party of record this day by placing the same in the U.S. mail, postage prepaid, addressed to each party of record.

Sincerely yours,

James M. Miller

Symes M. Muller

JMM/ej Enclosures

cc: Albert Yockey

Telephone (270) 926-4000 Telecopier (270) 683-6694

> 100 St. Ann Building PO Box 727 Owensboro, Kentucky 42302-0727

www.westkylaw.com

1 2	COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF KENTUCKED
3 4	JAN <b>2 8</b> 2013
5 6	In the Matter of:  PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
7	Application of Big Rivers Electric )
8	Corporation for a General ) Case No. 2012-00535
9	Adjustment in Rates )
10	
11 12	RESPONSE OF BIG RIVERS ELECTRIC CORPORATION TO KENTUCKY
13	INDUSTRIAL UTILITY CUSTOMERS, INC.'S MOTION FOR BIG RIVERS
14	ELECTRIC CORPORATION TO FILE A CORRECTED NOTICE
15	
16	Comes Big Rivers Electric Corporation ("Big Rivers"), by counsel, and for its
17	response to the motion of Kentucky Industrial Utility Customers, Inc. ("KIUC") to
18	require Big Rivers to provide a revised customer notice (the "Motion"), states as
19	follows:
20	1. The proposed percentage increase in rates stated by Big Rivers in its
21	notice to its three member distribution cooperatives ("Members") is correct. That
22	notice was in the form of a letter, which is attached to Big Rivers' application as Tab
23	10. The attachments included with the notice letter clearly set forth the amount of
24	the proposed rate change in both dollar amounts and percentage change for each
25	customer classification to which the proposed rate change will apply, as well as the
26	other information required by 807 KAR 5:001 Section 10.1 In fact, Big Rivers
27	provided the entire application and all attachments thereto to its Members as part
28	of the notice, which the notice letter makes clear.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Pursuant to the Commission's December 20, 2012, order in this matter, Big Rivers filed its application under the version of the Commission's regulations in effect prior to the January 4, 2013, revisions.

1	2. KIUC does not allege that Big Rivers made mathematical errors in
2	calculating the percent increase. KIUC's Motion also involves no allegation of error
3	relating to the dollar amounts of the proposed change that Big Rivers provided in
4	the notice. KIUC's claim that the percentages in the notice are incorrect is based
5	solely on the allegation that the only proper methodology was for Big Rivers to
6	provide the percentage change net of the Member Rate Stability Mechanism
7	("MRSM").

3. Big Rivers calculated the percent change gross of the effects of the MRSM. That methodology for calculating the percent change is the same methodology Big Rivers used in Case No. 2011-00036<sup>2</sup> without complaint from any party in that case, including KIUC, and the fact that the percentages Big Rivers provided are gross of the effects of the MRSM and other temporary mechanisms was plainly explained in the notice letter. More specifically, the notice letter explains:

The proposed adjustments in Big Rivers' wholesale electric rates and tariffs are more fully described in the copy of the complete filing enclosed with this letter. The numbers and percentages used in this paragraph are affected by certain mechanisms or adjustments that have a temporary or limited effect, namely, the Member Rate Stability Mechanism, Rural Economic Reserve Rider, and Non-Smelter Non-FAC PPA, all of which are explained in the Direct Testimony of John Wolfram, Tab 73 to the application.

4. KIUC's Motion includes the entirely unfounded allegation that Big Rivers' methodology was "misleading." It should be noted that neither KIUC nor the retail industrial customers that KIUC represents are customers of Big Rivers

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Tab 9 to Big Rivers' application in *In the Matter of: Application of Big Rivers Electric Corporation for a General Adjustment in Rates*, Case No. 2011-00036, which closely resembles the notice Big Rivers provided in this case.

- 1 entitled to notice under the Commission's regulations, and have no standing to
- 2 speak for the Members on their subjective reactions to the notice. KIUC's Motion
- 3 refers to the notice Big Rivers provided to its Members as a notice to the public;
- 4 however, under 807 KAR 5:001 Section 10(3), the notice is explicitly a notice to
- 5 customers, and thus, it is Big Rivers' customers (its three Members) that are
- 6 entitled to the notice. More importantly, however, Big Rivers' actual customers, its
- 7 Members, say in their responses to the KIUC Motion that they were not misled by
- 8 the notice, and they fully understand the amount and impact of the proposed
- 9 increase. Even KIUC, for whom the notice was not intended, understands the
- amount of the proposed increase, that the percentages Big Rivers provided were
- gross of the MRSM, and that different percentages (but not different dollar
- amounts) result if the percent increase is calculated using a different methodology.
- 5. KIUC, however, miscalculates the percent increase net of the MRSM
- 14 as 38.4% for the Rural class and 27.0% for the Large Industrial class. KIUC's
- 15 calculation is incorrect because it is based on only a subset of the test period, rather
- than the full test period, and overstates the percent increase net of the MRSM.
- 17 Using Exhibit Siewert-2 to the Direct Testimony of Travis A. Siewert (Tab 72 to the
- application), which is the same exhibit KIUC relied on for its calculation, the
- 19 percent wholesale increase to Big Rivers' Members net of the MRSM is 35.8% for
- 20 the Rural class and 22.1% for the Large Industrial class.
- 21 6. Finally, even if KIUC had standing to complain about the notice, it has
- 22 not shown that calculating the percent increase gross of the MRSM is flawed under

- 1 the Commission's regulations. In fact, Big Rivers notes that Commission Staff has
- 2 already found that the application meets the minimum filing requirements.<sup>3</sup>
- Thus, Big Rivers, its Members, and KIUC all understand the notice
- 4 Big Rivers provided to its Members. They fully understand what increase Big
- 5 Rivers is seeking. They understand the percent increase in the notice is gross of the
- 6 MRSM. They understand a different percent increase results under a different
- 7 methodology. There is no allegation that Big Rivers' calculation of the percent
- 8 increase gross of the MRSM was mathematically erroneous, KIUC has not shown
- 9 that calculating the percent increase gross of the MRSM is contrary to the
- 10 Commission's regulations, and Commission Staff found that Big Rivers' application
- 11 met the minimum filing requirements. For all of these reasons, KIUC's Motion is
- 12 nothing more than a curious diversion of the Commission's and the parties' time
- and resources, and should be denied.
- 14 WHEREFORE, Big Rivers respectfully requests that the Commission deny
- 15 KIUC's Motion.

17

On this the 25<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See letter from the Commission Staff to Big Rivers dated January 23, 2013, filed in the record in this matter.

1	Respectfully submitted,
2	
3	,
4	James M. mach
5	James M. Miller
6	Tyson Kamuf
7	SULLIVAN, MOUNTJOY,
8	STAINBACK & MILLER, P.S.C.
9	100 St. Ann Street
10	P. O. Box 727
11	Owensboro, Kentucky 42302-0727
12	Phone: (270) 926-4000
13	Facsimile: (270) 683-6694
14	jmiller@smsmlaw.com
15	tkamuf@smsmlaw.com
16	
17	
18	Edward T. Depp
19	Dinsmore & Shohl LLP
20	101 South Fifth Street
21	Suite 2500
22	Louisville, KY 40202
23	Phone: (502) 540-2347
24	Facsimile: (502) 585-2207
25	tip.depp@dinsmore.com
26	
27	
28	Counsel for Big Rivers Electric
29	Corporation
30	
31	
32	<u>Certificate of Notice</u>
33	
34	I certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was served by first
35	class mail, postage prepaid, upon the persons listed on the attached service list, on
36	this the 25 <sup>th</sup> day of January, 2013.
37	ı
38	Same to land
39	James M. Miller
40	vames W. Willer

## Service List PSC Case No. 2012-00535

Jennifer Hans Black Lawrence W. Cook Dennis G. Howard, II Assistant Attorneys General 1024 Capital Center Dr. Suite 200 Frankfort, KY 40601

Mr. David Brevitz 3623 SW Woodvalley Terrace Topeka, KS 66614

Mr. Bion C. Ostrander 1121 S.W. Chetopa Trail Topeka, KS 66615

Mr. Larry Holloway 830 Romine Ridge Osage City, KS 66523

Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. Kurt J. Boehm, Esq. Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 E. Seventh St., Suite 1510 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Lane Kollen
J. Kennedy and Associates, Inc.
570 Colonial Park Dr., Suite 305
Roswell, Georgia 30075

Russell L. Klepper Energy Services Group, LLC 316 Maxwell Road, Suite 400 Alpharetta, Georgia 30009

David C. Brown, Esq. Stites & Harbison, PLLC 400 W. Market Street, Suite 1800 Louisville, KY 40202 Donald P. Seberger, Esq. Special Counsel Rio Tinto Alcan 8770 West Bryn Mawr Avenue Chicago, Illinois 60631

Gregory Starheim
President & CEO
Kenergy Corp.
6402 Old Corydon Road
P.O. Box 18
Henderson, Kentucky 42419-0018

J. Christopher Hopgood, Esq. 318 Second Street Henderson, Kentucky 42420

Burns Mercer Meade County RECC 1351 Hwy. 79 P.O. Box 489 Brandenburg, Kentucky 40108

Thomas C. Brite, Esq. Brite & Hopkins, PLLC 83 Ballpark Road P.O. Box 309 Hardinsburg, KY 40143-0309

G. Kelly Nuckols
President and CEO
Jackson Purchase Energy Corporation
2900 Irvin Cobb Drive
P.O. Box 3188
Paducah, KY 42002-3188

Melissa D. Yates Denton & Keuler, LLP 555 Jefferson Street Suite 301 Paducah, KY 42001